

**MINUTES OF THE 2012 SESSION OF THE
BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW
CITY OF ESCANABA, MICHIGAN**

Tuesday Morning Session

9:03 a.m.

March 6, 2012

Pursuant to the statutes of the State of Michigan, the Board of Equalization and Review of the City of Escanaba, Michigan, convened in Room C102 of City Hall, 410 Ludington Street, on the above named date for the purpose of organization and reviewing the assessment roll prepared for the City by the Assessor for the year 2012, and/or any other items brought before the board.

Present: Board Members, Mayor Leo J. Evans, Dennis J. Pearson, William LaMarch, Jason Neumeier, and Judy Schroeder, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Robert S. Richards, Clerk of the Board.

Absent: None.

Assessor Daina Norden opened the meeting and called for nominations for the reorganization of the Board of Review.

Nominations were called for Chairperson of the 2012 Board of Review. Board Member Evans called for Board Member Pearson to serve as the 2012 Chairperson of the Board of Equalization and Review, and to close Nominations and cast a unanimous ballot for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairperson for the 2012 Board of Review. Ayes were Unanimous for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairperson for the 2012 Board of Review.

Evans moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to nominate Board Member Schroeder as Vice Chairperson.

Evans moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the December 13, 2011, Board of Review Minutes as submitted.

Evans moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the agenda as submitted.

It was the consensus of the Board to use approved Established 2011 Procedures for the 2012 Board of Review. Appeals will be 10 minutes each per appointment, with no more than two properties per appointment, and furthermore every appellant must fill out an appeal form. All decisions would be made after the appellants leave the room, and after further Board discussion and review.

City Assessor Daina Norden also reviewed with the Board Members, the following:

- Reviewed properties which went before the 2011 Michigan Tax Tribunal (MTT) hearings. A complete MTT list would be forwarded to Board Members for review;
- Reviewed 2012 Assessment Roll & Changes made by Assessor;
- Reviewed Equalization Factors by Sales information;
- Reviewed data input into BS&A Assessment Software;
- Discussed a possible Board Work Session.

The time being 10:10 a.m., and having no further business to come before the Board, or public

Board of Equalization and Review - continued
March 2012

comment, the Board recessed until March 12, 2012, 9:00 a.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued
 March 2012

Monday Session

9:00 a.m.

March 12, 2012

Present: Mayor Evans, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Norden, Assistant City Assessor Dubord, City Clerk Richards.

Absent: None

The Board heard the following protests and set new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2012 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
001.	Anthony Maturi 620 5 th Avenue South	010-2929-362-010	97,197	SEV 92,250 TAX 92,250
002.	Ellary LaPalm 1701 9 th Avenue South	090-2931-182-005	45,722	SEV 40,000 TAX 40,000
003.	Bobbi Silverstone 1426 Stephenson Avenue	370-2919-178-001	41,092	SEV 35,000 TAX 35,000
004.	Mark Forvilly 1611 16 th Avenue South	370-2919-132-002	19,677	SEV 14,000 TAX 14,000
	Mark Forvilly 1526 Stephenson Avenue	370-2919-132-016	2,250	SEV 1,000 TAX 1,000
005.	Eileen Kelly 2847 Lake Shore Drive	220-3501-426-002	34,219	SEV 26,250 TAX 26,250
006.	Sara LaMarch 515 South 10 th Street	010-2930-484-005	45,189	SEV 43,000 TAX 43,000
007.	Tony Mayville 429 South 17 th Street	340-2930-384-010	46,871	SEV 38,000 TAX 37,128
008.	Allegro Properties 1325 North 16 th Street	370-2919-182-010	24,062	SEV 18,000 TAX 18,000
009.	Beverly Peacock 223 South 18 th Street	350-2930-337-006	36,336	SEV 20,000 TAX 20,000
010.	Leo Milkiewicz 2402 8 th Avenue South	420-2836-200-019	42,398	No Change
011.	Susan Moir 1424 North Lincoln Road	370-2919-153-001	195,609	SEV 140,000 TAX 140,000
012.	Betty Le Duc 324 North 21 st Street	190-2930-153-002	27,589	Cancelled
013.	Ted Broeders 2654 Lake Shore Drive	210-3606-302-009	16,447	SEV 9,000 TAX 9,000
014.	Sonia Krupski 625 North 19 th Street	130-2930-102-011	26,039	SEV 7,000 TAX 7,000
015.	Brian Horst 313 North 10 th Street	010-2930-277-014	29,605	SEV 23,000 TAX 23,000
016.	Dave Kobasic 313 South 12 th Street	010-2930-476-005	60,489	SEV 45,000 TAX 45,000

The time being 12:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 12, 2012, at 1:00 p.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2012

Monday Session

1:00 p.m.

March 12, 2012

Present: Mayor Evans, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Norden, Assistant City Assessor Dubord, City Clerk Richards.

Absent: None

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2012 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
017.	Frances Balcerak 1427 North 16 th Street	370-2919-178-009	31,622	SEV 31,000 TAX 31,000
018.	Craig Taylor 1010 1 st Avenue North	010-2930-280-016	23,418	SEV 13,000 TAX 13,000 Nay LaMarch
019.	DeGrand Reardon & Hall 517 Ludington Street	010-2929-308-004	128,013	SEV 90,000 TAX 90,000
020.	DeGrand Reardon & Hall 523 Ludington Street	010-2929-308-001	13,995	SEV 9,250 TAX 9,209
021.	Rick LaMarch 308 South 14 th Street	320-2930-414-014	62,684	SEV 50,000 TAX 50,000
022.	Rick LaMarch 2616 7 th Place	412-2836-200-015	55,135	SEV 45,000 TAX 45,000
023.	L&K Property Investments, LLC 206 North 21 st Street	190-2930-157-007	20,224	SEV 15,000 TAX 15,000
024.	L&K Property Investments, LLC 1415 Stephenson Avenue	370-2919-177-012	30,569	SEV 24,000 TAX 24,000
025.	L&K Property Investments, LLC 308 North 11 th Street	010-2930-476-014	45,374	SEV 30,000 TAX 30,000
026.	Sharen Kuether 2910 14 th Avenue South	420-2836-400-033	39,489	SEV 33,500 TAX 33,500
027.	Joseph Kaplan 2315 Lake Shore Drive	210-3606-183-018	54,992	SEV 52,000 TAX 52,000
028.	Joseph Kaplan 2721 Lake Shore Drive	210-3606-304-003	15,127	No Change
029.	Gary Sovey 809 South 16 th Street	090-2931-140-003	34,351	SEV 27,500 TAX 27,500
030.	Corey Kuchenberg 112 North 11 th Street	010-2930-427-001	359,879	SEV 250,000 TAX 250,000
031.	Laurie Skrobiak 2318 Ludington Street	120-2825-427-011	34,609	SEV 29,000 TAX 29,000

The time being 4:00 p.m. the Board recessed until Wednesday, March 14, 2012, 1:00 p.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued
 March 2012

Wednesday Session

1:00 p.m.

March 14, 2012

Present: Mayor Evans, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Norden, Assistant City Assessor Dubord, City Clerk Richards.

Absent: None

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2012 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
032.	Niagara Logistics Inc. 2211 20 th Avenue North	420-2918-300-014	49,475	SEV 16,000 TAX 16,000
033.	Niagara Logistics Inc. 1829 North 21 st Street	420-2918-300-022	80,758	SEV 67,500 TAX 67,500
034.	Rick LaMarch 2615 7 th Avenue South	412-2836-200-012	57,745	SEV 45,000 TAX 45,000
035.	Rick LaMarch 2611 7 th Avenue South	412-2836-200-013	57,459	SEV 45,000 TAX 45,000
036.	Rick LaMarch 2610 7 th Place	412-2836-200-014	56,271	SEV 45,000 TAX 45,000
037.	Holly Suerwier 903 Washington Avenue	270-2919-367-015	39,847	SEV 35,000 TAX 35,000
038.	Lincoln Fair Storage LLC 2229 9 th Avenue North	420-2919-300-002	139,451	SEV 90,000 TAX 90,000
039.	Paula Marvic 900 Ludington Street	010-2930-428-018	53,763	SEV 47,500 TAX No Change
040.	Paula Marvic 2727 North Lincoln Road	420-2813-200-008	338,837	SEV 300,000 TAX No Change
041.	Paula Marvic 2805 North Lincoln Road	420-2813-200-015	313,947	SEV 210,000 TAX 210,000
042.	Paula Marvic 2717 North Lincoln Road	420-2813-200-018	308,992	SEV 240,000 TAX 240,000
043.	L&K Property Investments, LLC 415 South 10 th Street	010-2930-481-005	39,949	SEV 35,000 TAX 35,000
044.	L&K Property Investments, LLC 1600 17 th Avenue South	180-2931-379-013	61,888	SEV 50,000 TAX 50,000
045.	Christopher Davenport 309 South 13 th Street	320-2930-416-004	39,683	SEV 37,500 TAX 37,500
046.	Russell & Summer Watson 2713 Lake Shore Drive	210-3606-304-005	37,727	SEV 30,000 TAX 30,000
047.	Donald LeMire 1801 South 22 nd Place	175-2931-300-004	41,463	SEV 35,000 TAX 35,000

The time being 4:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 14, 2012, at 6:00 p.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued
March 2012

Wednesday Session

6:00 p.m.

March 14, 2012

Present: Mayor Evans, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Norden, Assistant City Assessor Dubord, City Clerk Richards.

Absent: None

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

048.	Patrick & Deborah Ratkovich 2115 20 th Avenue South	380-3606-101-008	39,695	SEV 34,000 TAX 34,000
049.	Steven & Suzanne Miller 2303 Lake Shore Drive	210-3606-183-019	72,822	SEV 57,500 TAX 57,500
050.	Jeff Diebolt 314 North 11 th Street	010-2930-277-006	21,469	SEV 18,500 TAX 18,500
051.	Jeff Diebolt 1112 Stephenson Avenue	260-2919-328-005	30,543	SEV 27,000 TAX 27,000
052.	Brad Hansen 2116 South 22 nd Street	420-2931-100-028	13,650	No Change
053.	Mathew Stenberg 1806 24 th Avenue South	200-3606-185-006	35,789	SEV 31,000 TAX 31,000

The time being 9:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 21, 2012, at 1:00 p.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2012

055.	Rokalolu Investments 208 North 15 th Street	320-2930-257-005	24,758	SEV 16,500 TAX 16,500
056.	Antonio R. Ruiz 122 1 st Avenue South	010-2929-401-003	42,523	SEV 38,500 TAX 38,500
057.	Michael & Diane LaFave 316 South 14 th Street	320-2930-414-017	19,120	SEV 14,250 TAX 14,250
058.	Michael Blevins 222 South 19 th Street	010-2930-433-015	38,881	No Change
059.	Susan Jacobson 2211 Lake Shore Drive	210-2606-179-001	111,213	SEV 105,000 TAX 105,000
060.	Rich Mortl 510 South 29 th Street	290-2825-451-026	62,512	No Change

2012 HARDSHIP EXEMPTION REQUESTS

The Board reviewed and acted on the following Hardship Exemptions presented by City Assessor Daina Norden:

Evans moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve a Soldiers and Sailors request from Mary Casey, 340-2930-377-003, 323 South 19th Street.

Evans moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table a Hardship Application request from Denise Adams, 412-2836-200-017, 2611 7th Place, until the 2012 July Board of Review. The Board based decision on lack of financial information regarding house and car ownership, marital status, and child support.

LaMarch moved, Pearson seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Theresa Adams, 090-2931-186-004, 1805 10th Avenue South.

LaMarch moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to deny a hardship exemption application from Edward Bergeon because he exceeded Income guidelines. 200-3606-186-004, 2514 Lake Shore Drive.

Schroeder moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table a Hardship Application request from Carrie Brabyn, 420-2836-200-088, 2711 7th Avenue South, until the 2012 July Board of Review. The Board based decision on lack of financial information, a Janet Brabyn shows up as a resident at the address and the Board wishes proof she does not live at the address.

There being public comment the Board recessed until March 23, 2012, at 1:00 pm.

Friday Session

1:00 p.m.

March 23, 2012

Present: Mayor Evans, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Norden, Assistant City Assessor Dubord, City Clerk Richards.

Absent: None

2012 HARDSHIP EXEMPTION REQUESTS

The Board reviewed and acted on the following Hardship Exemptions presented by City Assessor Daina Norden:

Neumeier moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table a Hardship Application request from Kevin Brabyn, 420-2836-200-089, 2717 7th Avenue South, until the 2012 July Board of Review. The Board based decision on lack of financial information, and wishes to review tax return for 2011.

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Cheryl Corbiere, 320-2930-456-013, 510 South 14th Street.

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Marvel Goodman, 260-2919-339-011, 943 Sheridan Road.

LaMarch moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table a Hardship Application request from Betty Homernik, 010-2930-479-014, 404 South 11th Street, until the 2012 July Board of Review. The Board based decision on obtaining further clarification on income and expenses, Joseph's income and status of Diana Homernik. Board wished to see proof that Diana Homernik does not reside at the property address.

Evans moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to James Kern, 130-2930-130-010, 531 North 18th Street.

Schroeder moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table a Hardship Application request from Sonia Krupski, 130-2930-102-011, 625 North 19th Street, until the 2012 July Board of Review. The Board based decision on obtaining further clarification on household finances, rent, and college income.

Schroeder moved, LaMarch seconded, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Verna LaPalm, 350-2930-337-007, 1720 2nd Avenue South.

Ayes: Schroeder, LaMarch, Neumeier, Pearson
Nays: None
Abstain: Evans

Pearson moved, Evans seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Christine Lauderville, 370-2919-151-003, 1416 North 23rd Street.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued
March 2012

LaMarch moved, Evans seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Frank Sacco, 370-2919-180-010, 1323 North 18th Street.

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Christine Truitt, 010-2930-281-003, 218 North 10th Street.

Pearson moved, Evans seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Clara Viau, 370-2919-177-015, 1402 Stephenson Avenue.

Schroeder moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to Lil Zorza, 010-2930-429-013, 1114 1st Avenue South.

All changes to taxable values are also reflected in changes to the 2012 assessment roll.

There being no further business or public comment to come before the 2012 Board of Equalization and Review the Board adjourned at 2:15 p.m. until the call of the Chair.

Respectfully submitted,

Robert S. Richards, CMC,
Clerk of the Board