

**MINUTES OF THE 2011 SESSION OF THE  
BOARD OF EQUALIZATION AND REVIEW  
CITY OF ESCANABA, MICHIGAN**

Tuesday Afternoon Session

9:00 a.m.

March 8, 2011

Pursuant to the statutes of the State of Michigan, the Board of Equalization and Review of the City of Escanaba, Michigan, convened in Room C102 of City Hall, 410 Ludington Street, on the above named date for the purpose of organization and reviewing the assessment roll prepared for the City by the Assessor for the year 2011, and/or any other items brought before the board.

**Present:** Board Members, Mayor Gilbert X. Cheves, Dennis J. Pearson, William LaMarch, Jason Neumeier (arrived at 9:17 a.m.), and Judy Schroeder, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Robert S. Richards, Clerk of the Board.

**Absent:** None.

Assessor Daina Norden opened the meeting and called for nominations for the reorganization of the Board of Review.

Nominations were called for Chair Person of the Board. Board Member LaMarch called for Board Member Pearson to serve as the 2011 Chairman of the Board of Equalization and Review, and to close Nominations and cast a unanimous ballot for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairman for the 2011 Board of Review. Ayes were Unanimous for Board Member Pearson to serve as Chairman for the 2011 Board of Review.

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to nominate Board Member Schroeder as Vice Chairperson.

Cheves moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the December 14, 2010, Board of Review Minutes as submitted.

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the Established 2011 Procedures same as last year, that appeals will be 10 minutes each per appointment, with no more than two properties per appointment, and further more every appellant must fill out an appeal form. All decisions would be made after the appellants leave the room, and after further Board discussion and review.

- Reviewed 2011 Assessment Roll & Changes Made by Assessor:

City Assessor Daina Norden reviewed with the Board Members, the following:

- Reviewed Sales information (Residential was now 1 year, Commercial was 2 years), Ad-valorem Roll, DNR Roll, IFT and OPRA Roll;
- Reappraisal for commercial property was scheduled for next year, approximately 788 parcels;
- Residential taxable value was increased by the same percentage, 1.7 percent, based on the state factor based on inflation.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

- Review of 2011 Assessment Roll and changes made by Assessor;
  - Reviewed New Assessment Software, BS&A.

The time being 9:44 a.m., and having no further business to come before the Board, or public comment, the Board recessed until March 14, 2011, 9:00 a.m.

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

Monday Session

9:00 a.m.

March 14, 2011

**Present:** Mayor Cheves, Chairperson Pearson, Board Members LaMarch, Neumeier, Schroeder, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, City Clerk Robert S. Richards.

**Absent:** None

The Board heard the following protests and set new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2011 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
001.	Steven Hay 2204 26 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	210-3606-301-009	47,195	SEV 42,673 TV 42,673
002.	VanEffen Enterprises 120 North 6 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2929-304-001	154,101	SEV 137,500 TV 137,500
003.	Karen Kelly 2000 6 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	420-2919-300-016	73,133	No Change
004.	Dennis Beauchamp Sandra VanDenBerg 209 North 13 <sup>th</sup> Street	320-2930-258-014	32,276	No Change No basis for reduction
005.	Paul Paulsen 2225 5 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	420-2930-356-001	32,894	No Change
006.	Tony Maturi 620 5 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	010-2929-362-010	112,353	No Change
007.	Allegro Properties 413 South 9 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2929-355-005	24,454	SEV 18,677 TV 18,677
008.	Nick Anderson 211 South 10 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2930-434-002	59,480	SEV 37,668 TV 37,668
009.	Patricia Unger 933 North 20 <sup>th</sup> Street	050-2919-303-018	48,486	SEV 42,395 TV 42,395
010.	Lori Owens (Mail Paper Work to here) 1530 South 30 <sup>th</sup> Street	420-2836-300-019	32,136	SEV 29,846 TV 29,846
011.	Albert Marohnic 231 South 22 <sup>nd</sup> Street	120-2930-306-014	41,206	SEV 32,947 TV 32,947
012.	M&M Enterprises 624 Ludington Street	010-2929-303-002	496,910	No Change Cheves, LaMarch, Schroeder Neumeier nay
013.	Rebedon Inc 616 Ludington Street	010-2929-303-001	105,884	SEV 62,500 TV 62,500
014.	Lisa Johnson 1202 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street	370-2919-184-008	43,043	No Change
015.	Tracy Anderson 1606 12 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	090-2931-194-004	58,942	No Show
016.	Jane Larson 221 South 11 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2930-433-008	22,242	No Change
017.	Todd LaFave 1919 South Lincoln Road	420-3606-100-005	35,544	No Change
018.	Mark Robitaille	420-2930-357-003	54,063	No Change

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

1921 5<sup>th</sup> Avenue South

The time being 12:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 14, 2011, at 1:00 p.m.

Tuesday Session

1:00 p.m.

March 14, 2011

**Present:** Chairman Pearson, Board Members Mayor Cheves, Neumeier, Schroeder, and LaMarch, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Richards.

**Absent:** None

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2011 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
019.	James Lake 314 South 6 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2929-353-010	53,802	No Change
020.	Greg Morehouse 613 North 16 <sup>th</sup> Street	390-2930-128-015	29,895	SEV 25,122 TV 25,122
021.	Chapel, Inc. 221 South 13 <sup>th</sup> Street	320-2930-412-008	187,179	SEV 149,000 TV 149,000
022.	Pencom Development Inc. 907 Ludington Street	010-2930-431-003	62,091	Withdrawn
023.	Dave Harris 1511 3 <sup>rd</sup> Avenue South	320-2930-451-001	16,873	No Change
024.	Peterlin & Sons 1001 Ludington Street	010-2930-430-010	85,945	SEV 40,000 TV 40,000
025.	Richard Larsen 112 South 13 <sup>th</sup> Street	320-2930-407-013	25,937	All Ayes, LaMarch Opposed No Change
026.	Dave Wallin 2809 8 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	420-2836-200-086	57,686	SEV 40,000 TV 40,000
027.	Dave Harris 3601 8 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	420-2836-100-047	49,224	No Change
028.	Pat Royer 709 5 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	170-3632-102-004	115,613	No Change
029.	Kris & Donald Montgomery 1208 South 15 <sup>th</sup> Street	100-2931-259-003	69,095	No Change
030.	Gary Wery 114 North 25 <sup>th</sup> Street	120-2825-427-001	99,957	Cheves recused himself No Change
031.	Josh Randall 208 South 18 <sup>th</sup> Street	350-2930-336-009	34,167	No Show
032.	Carl & Ruth Carley 429 South 11 <sup>th</sup> Street	010-2930-480-009	49,527	No Change
033.	Carl & Ruth Carley 1020 4 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	010-2930-480-010	19,945	SEV 10,305 TV 10,305
034.	Michael Pomeroy 2808 8 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	420-2836-200-072	53,438	SEV 44,683 TV 44,683
035.	Ray Richards 718 Ludington Street	010-2929-302-005	73,925	No Change
036.	Chris Williams	210-3606-304-003	26,151	No Change

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

2721 Lake Shore Drive

The time being 4:00 p.m. the Board recessed until Wednesday, March 16, 2011, 1:00 p.m.

Wednesday Session

1:00 p.m.

March 16, 2011

**Present:** Chairman Pearson, Board Members Neumeier, Schroeder, and LaMarch, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Richards.

**Absent:** Mayor Cheves

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

	NAME	ADDITION	PROPOSED 2011 ASSESSMENT	BOARD OF REVIEW ASSESSMENT
037.	K. Enterprise Rentals 3021 North Lincoln Road	420-2812-400-012	195,824	No Change
038.	K. Enterprise Rentals 3400 Ludington Street	420-2825-300-007	126,559	No Change
039.	K. Enterprise Rentals 3500 Ludington Street	420-2825-300-008	95,073	No Change
040.	K. Enterprise Rentals 3500 Ludington Street	420-2825-300-012	390,465	No Change
041.	Alfred & Millie Niquette 801 Ludington Street	010-2929-305-007	100,008	No Change
042.	Alfred & Millie Niquette 812 1 <sup>st</sup> Avenue South	010-2929-305-011	11,352	No Change
043.	Alfred & Millie Niquette 815 Ludington Street	010-2929-305-004	48,417	SEV 32,500 TV 32,500
044.	Alfred & Millie Niquette 811 Ludington Street	010-2929-305-005	38,029	SEV 15,000 TV 15,000
045.	Bosk Properties 2900 27 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	325-2813-201-007		Change Commercial to Industrial Classification
046.	Bosk Properties 2105 23 Avenue North	420-2918-300-028		No Change
047.	Bosk Properties 1921 23 <sup>rd</sup> Avenue North	420-2918-300-027		Change Commercial to Industrial Classification
048.	Bosk Properties 3112 29 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	420-2812-300-004	54,532	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded to uncap property
049.	Bosk Properties 2303 9 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	420-2824-400-018	82,611	No Change
050.	Bosk Properties 2811 North 28 <sup>th</sup> St	325-2813-201-002	247,136	SEV 220,000 TV 220,000
051.	Bosk Properties 2003 23 <sup>rd</sup> Avenue North Lincoln	420-2918-300-026		Change Commercial to Industrial Classification
052.	Bosk Properties 2827 North Lincoln Road	420-2813-200-012	402,168	SEV 385,000
053.	Emily Haas 1600 South 30 <sup>th</sup> Street Lot 47	424-0000-700-047	2,542	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded change classification to D and SEV 1,313 TV 1,313

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

054.	Paul & Lee Ann Rodman 905 South 16 <sup>th</sup> Street	090-2931-144-002	57,764	SEV 41,221 TV 41,221
055.	Daniel J. Kobasic 2101 Lake Shore Drive	420-3606-200-006	118,682	SEV 100,000 TV 100,000
056.	Daniel J. Kobasic 2105 Lake Shore Drive	420-3606-200-007	159,627	No Change
057.	Joshua Randal 208 South 18 <sup>th</sup> Street	350-2930-336-009	34,167	SEV 21,500 TV 21,500
058.	U.P. Enterprises L.L.C. KMART	420-2919-300-027	1,135,988	No Change
059.	U.P. Enterprises L.L.C. KMART	420-2919-300-028	762,592	No Change
060.	U.P. Enterprises L.L.C. 2401 1 <sup>st</sup> Avenue North	120-2825-427-002	341,358	SEV 300,000 TV 300,000
061.	Robert & Jeanine Dagenais 2625 Ludington Street	420-2825-400-005	433,037	No Change
062.	David Hackleman 516 North 20 <sup>th</sup> Street	130-2930-104-005	70,939	SEV 52,588 TV 52,588
063.	Russell & Jamie Beaver 1426 North 16 <sup>th</sup> Street	370-2919-179-002	27,260	No Change
064.	UP Apartments LLC 409 South 14 <sup>th</sup> Street	320-2930-453-004	54,933	No Change
065.	Frank Bink 123 22 <sup>nd</sup> Street	120-2930-306-005	22,172	No Change
066.	Frank Bink 1210 Ludington Street	320-2930-404-019	66,098	SEV 47,500 TV 47,500
067.	Kathleen A. Fyhr 301 South 18 <sup>th</sup> Street	350-2930-342-001	31,606	SEV 25,158 TV 25,158
068.	Jeff Lampi 1517 17 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	180-2931-382-001	64,226	SEV 49,539 TV 49,539
069.	Thompson Trust 400 North Lincoln Road	120-2930-151-001	323,917	No Change
070.	Junior Lee Bruff 1510 South 13 <sup>th</sup> Street	060-2931-409-008	51,940	Schroeder Abstained SEV 47,393

The time being 4:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 16, 2011, at 6:00 p.m.

Wednesday Session

6:00 p.m.

March 16, 2011

**Present:** Chairman Pearson, Board Members Mayor Cheves, Neumeier, Schroeder, and LaMarch, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Richards.

**Absent:** None

The Board heard the following protests and set the new assessments:

071.	Francis & Linda Otradovec 2215 3 <sup>rd</sup> Avenue South	040-2930-352-001	61,039	SEV 49,932 TV 49,932
072.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec	420-2815-400-002	6,624	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, Carried UNANIMOUSLY. Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or

Board of Equalization and Review - continued  
 March 2011

				Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
073.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec	420-2814-300-001	16,808	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, Carried UNANIMOUSLY. Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
074.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec	420-2823-100-002	5,216	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, Carried UNANIMOUSLY. Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
075.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec	420-2822-200-002	3,064	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, Carried UNANIMOUSLY. Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
076.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec 5209 19 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	420-2823-100-003	26,340	Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
077.	Great Lakes Sports & Rec 5211 19 <sup>th</sup> Avenue North	420-2823-100-001	88,613	Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, Carried UNANIMOUSLY. Lack of documentation. No Change in Assessments, or Taxable Values, and No Change to Classification
078.	Jennifer Marie DeGrand 711 South Lincoln Road	150-2931-104-002	53,373	SEV 45,352 TV 45,352
079.	William T. Dufour 1200 10 <sup>th</sup> Avenue South	100-2931-254-012	55,888	No Change
080.	Mike Decker 2317 Ludington Street	120-2825-429-004	110,400	SEV 90,000 TV 90,000
081.	Mike Decker 401 Stephenson Avenue	360-2930-176-003	86,070	No Change
082.	Dennis Dyszel 319 North 16 <sup>th</sup> Street	360-2930-180-013	26,229	No Change

The time being 9:00 p.m., the Board recessed until March 21, 2011, at 9:00 a.m.

Monday Session

9:08 a.m.

March 21, 2011

**Present:** Board Members, Mayor Cheves, Acting Chair Person Schroeder, Jason Neumeier (arrived at 9:40 a.m.) and LaMarch, City Assessor Daina Norden, Assistant City Assessor Kevin P. Dubord, and City Clerk Richards.

**Absent:** Chair Pearson Dennis Pearson

**HARDSHIP EXEMPTIONS**

The Board reviewed and acted on the following Hardship Exemptions were presented by City

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

Assessor Daina Norden:

LaMarch moved, Cheves seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Dubord, Ronald J      411 South 9<sup>th</sup> Street      010-2929-355-004

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Robert Jensen      602 Lake Shore Drive      010-2929-362-016

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Christine Truitt      218 North 10<sup>th</sup> Street      010-2930-281-003

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Lil Zorza      1114 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South      010-2930-429-013

LaMarch moved, Cheves seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Betty Homernik      404 South 11<sup>th</sup> Street      010-2930-479-014

LaMarch moved, Cheves seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table the following hardship application to the July Board of Review:

Jesse Coates      1620 8<sup>th</sup> Avenue South      090-2931-139-009      Lack of documentation. Applicant needs to provide additional income information

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Theresa Adams      1805 10<sup>th</sup> Avenue South      090-2931-186-004

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table the following hardship application to the July Board of Review:

Allan Larson      528 North 21<sup>st</sup> Street      130-2930-103-003      Lack of information and expenses

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

James Kern      531 North 18<sup>th</sup> Street      130-2930-130-010

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Marnel Goodman      943 Sheridan Road      260-2919-339-011

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Julie Lucier      815 North 18<sup>th</sup> Street      270-2919-381-013

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to deny a hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Karen Beauchamp      213 North 14<sup>th</sup> Street      320-2930-257-014      Income exceed policy guidelines

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Marieda Charlebois      1406 1<sup>st</sup> Avenue South      320-2930-406-007

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to table the following hardship application to the July Board of Review:

Ceryl Corbiere      510 South 14<sup>th</sup> Street      320-2930-456-013      Insufficient Information. Need to verify daughters dependency

LaMarch moved, Cheves seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Dorothy Arnold      223 South 18<sup>th</sup> Street      350-2930-337-006

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Verna LaPlam      1720 2<sup>nd</sup> Avenue South      350-2930-337-007

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Clara Viau      1403 Stephenson Avenue      370-2919-177-015

LaMarch moved, Schroeder seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to grant a 100 percent hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Frاند Succo      1323 North 18<sup>th</sup> Street      370-2919-180-010

Cheves moved, LaMarch seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to deny a hardship exemption to the following hardship application:

Gregory Morehouse      613 North 16<sup>th</sup> Street      390-2930-128-015      Lack of information and income exceeds policy guidelines

The Board reviewed the following protests and made the following assessment changes:

083.	Allegro Properties 902 South 18 <sup>th</sup> Street	090-2931-141-004	34,314	No Change
084.	Allegro Properties 117 North 19 <sup>th</sup> Street	190-2930-160-004	24,004	No Change
085.	Judith Schroeder 1203 Willow Creek Road	420-2836-100-032	49,659	Schroeder recused Cheves appointed Temporary Chair LaMarch, Neumeier, SEV 44,997 All Ayes TV 44,997
086.	Rubloff Mall	120-2825-278-001	4,416,000	No Change
087.	Robert Sullivan 914 Ludington Street	010-2930-428-011	32,206	No Change
088.	Jeremy Peacock	260-2919-333-012	31,860	SEV 27,742

Board of Equalization and Review - continued

March 2011

1603 11<sup>th</sup> Avenue North  
089. Airgas North Central 310-2919-351-004  
906 North Lincoln Road  
090. Sterling Investment Properties 010-2929-307-001  
LLC  
623 Ludington Street

TV 27,742  
Tax Tribunal reduced 2010  
Taxable Value 50,850  
Received after Board of  
Review. No action

**Personal Property**

Cheves moved, Neumeier seconded, **CARRIED UNANIMOUSLY**, to approve the following Personal Property Changes:

Property Number	Current A/V	Corrected A/V	Business	Reason for change
051-430-0000-256-400	7995	0	J & S Auto	Closed
051-430-0000-107-575	1160	0	8 <sup>th</sup> Street Coffee	Closed
051-430-0000-056-500	103624	26852	Christopher & Banks	Late File
051-430-0000-200-400	22303	3067	Inergy Propane	Late File
051-430-0000-106-300	27094	19150	Dish Network	Late File
051-430-0000-244-300	648	0	Marquette General	Equipment Gone
051-430-0000-030-100	13259	8687	Bayside Eng	Late File
051-430-0000-159-750	19577	12022	Rettig	Remove leasehold
051-430-0000-067-250	12410	12410	Central UP	Late File
051-430-0000-368-200	0	7333	S & S Broadband	New File
051-430-0000-184-200	17350	5890	Hiawatha Motel	Late File
051-430-0000-394-875	313	320	Transaction Network	Late File
051-430-0000-084-000	393062	366620	Schneiders	Late File
051-430-0000-105-430	26600	23522	DC Industries	Late File
051-430-0000-127-250	14694	13454	Family Video	Late File
051-430-0000-306-500	0	44093	Pepsi Cola, Iron Mt	Late File

All changes to taxable values are also reflected in changes to the 2011 assessment roll.

There being no further business or public comment to come before the 2011 Board of Equalization and Review and the Board adjourned at 1:40 p.m. until the call of the Chair.

Respectfully submitted,

---

Robert S. Richards, CMC,  
Clerk of the Board