

**PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING
ESCANABA, MICHIGAN
July 9, 2015**

A meeting of the Escanaba Planning Commission was held on Thursday, July 9, 2015, at 6:00 p.m. at the City Hall/Library Complex, 410 Ludington Street, Escanaba, MI 49829.

PRESENT: Chairman Patrick Connor, Vice Chairperson Kelvin Smyth, Commissioners Paul Caswell, James Hellerman, Brian Black, Stephen Buckbee, and Christine Williams

EXCUSED: Commissioners Thomas Warstler and Roy Webber

ALSO PRESENT: City Manager Jim O'Toole, Executive Assistant Buffy Smith, Sam Reese, of Upper Hand Brewery and Danielle Bradford of Boyce and Associates

Meeting called to order at 6:00 p.m. by Chairman Patrick Connor

ROLL CALL

Executive Assistant Buffy Smith conducted the roll call.

APPROVAL/CORRECTION OF THE JUNE 11, 2015 PLANNING COMMISSION MEETING MINUTES

A motion was made by Vice Chairperson Smyth, seconded by Commissioner Caswell, to amend the June 11, 2015 Meeting Minutes to include the motion of approval to review the Bay de Noc Community site plan as submitted. Ayes were unanimous.

APPROVAL/ADJUSTMENTS TO THE AGENDA

None.

CONFLICT OF INTEREST DECLARATIONS

Commissioner Hellerman stated he did prior contract work when they originally opened but did not have a financial stake in the matter.

UNFINISHED BUSINESS

None.

PUBLIC HEARING

Site Plan Review – Bell's Brewery, Inc. – 3525 Airport Road

City Manager O'Toole stated the details of the Bell's Brewery, Inc. 6,000 square foot addition to the existing microbrewery and bottling plant as noted below:

TYPE OF REQUEST:

Site Plan Review and Approval. In accordance with Section 1801.3. Site Plan Required of Escanaba's Zoning Ordinance, a site plan review for a land use permit must be conducted prior to

the use permit issuance for their proposed 6,000 square foot addition.

CURRENT ZONING:

Light Manufacturing District (F)

ORDINANCE:

Ordinance No.1028 Escanaba Zoning Ordinance

DESCRIPTION OF PROPOSED PROJECT:

Bell's Upper Hand Brewery, Inc. has submitted a land use application to construct a 6,000 sq. ft. addition to their microbrewery and bottling manufacturing plant located within the Delta County Renaissance Zone.

COMPLIANCE WITH DEVELOPMENT STANDARDS:

1. The proposed construction will be located on property which is zoned Light Manufacturing District (F). The use is a permitted use by right as outlined in Section 1302.1.O.
2. The proposed construction meets the setback standards of the districts.
3. The preliminary proposed construction site plan diagram complies with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1802 Site Plan Diagram/Requirements, paragraph 1802.2 Site Plan Diagram Requirements, subparagraphs A - X.
4. In accordance with the requirements found in Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph 1803.1.1.1. Pre-Application Conference, a staff meeting was conducted on June 25, 2015.
5. In accordance with the requirements found in Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph Section 1803.1.1.2. Application, the applicant applied for site plan consideration as required.
6. In accordance with the requirements found in Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph Section 1803.1.1.3. Official Review, an official City administration preliminary review was conducted for comments as to the proposed development's conformance to all applicable standards and requirements.
7. In accordance with the requirements found in Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph Section 1803.1.1.4. Approval; Referral, City administration has deemed the site diagram to be complete.
8. All fee and notification requirements of the Ordinance have been accommodated.

DUTIES OF THE PLANNING COMMISSION:

City Manager O'Toole cited the Duties of the Planning Commission as noted below:

In accordance with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph 1803.2. Public Hearing Requirement, prior to voting on a final site plan, the

Planning Commission must hold a Public Hearing so as to facilitate public review and understanding of the proposed development. In accordance with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph 1803.3. Planning Commission Review, once a site plan is forwarded to the Planning Commission, the Planning Commission is required to review the site plan according to the standards and requirements of Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards. The Planning Commission must approve or deny the site plan according to the standards and requirements of the Zoning Ordinance within 45 days of submission of said plan.

In accordance with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph 1803.4. Site Plan Approval, should the Planning Commission approve the site plan, the applicant, the owner of record, or the legal representative thereof, the Planning Commission Chairperson and one other member of the Planning Commission shall each sign four copies of the approved site plan. The Planning Commission shall transmit one signed copy of the plan and any conditions attached to the Code Official, and one signed copy each to the office of the City Clerk and the applicant. One signed copy shall be retained in the Planning Commission file.

In accordance with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1803 Site Plan Review, paragraph 1803.5.1 Site Plan Rejection, should the Planning Commission reject the site plan, the property owner may appeal the decision to the Zoning Board of Appeals.

SITE PLAN APPROVAL STANDARDS:

City Manager O'Toole stated the Site Plan Approval Standards as noted below:

In accordance with Section 1804. Site Plan Approval Standards of Escanaba's Zoning Ordinance, the proposed site conforms to the following site development standards:

- A. The main entrance faces the street upon which the lot fronts as do the proposed additions.
- B. All roof mounted equipment will be screened.
- C. Reasonable and visible sound mitigation measures have been taken.
- D. The building is arranged to permit adequate emergency access to all sides.
- E. The development has legal access to the public street, that being Airport Road.
- F. The development provides for vehicular and pedestrian circulation. Sidewalks will be installed when installed throughout the industrial park.
- G. A pedestrian circulation system is provided within the footprint of the building. Public sidewalks will be installed when installed throughout the industrial park.
- H. All parking areas are designed to facilitate safe and efficient vehicular and pedestrian circulation.
- I. No new curbs are being proposed.
- J. All loading and unloading areas and outside storage areas shall be adequately screened. Recycling storage areas have been provided.
- K. Exterior lights shall be reflected downward and away from adjacent properties and right-

of-ways.

- L. Adequate utilities will be provided and placed underground.
- M. All premises shall be graded to prevent accumulation of stagnant water.

STAFF FINDINGS, COMMENT, GENERAL PLAN GOALS AND CONDITIONS OF APPROVAL:

City Manager O'Toole cited the staff findings, comment, general plan goals and conditions of approval as noted below:

- 1. Staff is recommending approval of the site plan diagram for the following reasons:
 - A. The proposed use is consistent with the zoning designation for the district.
 - B. The proposed use is an approved use by right in accordance with the zoning ordinance.
 - C. The proposed addition meets all setback and area requirements of the district.

FISCAL IMPACT:

The construction value of the accessory building is estimated to be \$900,000. Approximately 5 new jobs are being projected.

PUBLIC CONTACT:

Notice of Public Hearing was published in the Escanaba Daily Press Newspaper and meeting notices were mailed to the adjacent property owners of the project site.

The meeting agenda was posted on the City's official notice bulletin board and the City of Escanaba's website.

STANDARDS AND QUESTIONS (FINDING OF FACTS):

In accordance with Chapter 18. Site Plan and Sketch Plan Standards, Section 1801 General, paragraph 1801.1. Purpose, the Planning Commission must ensure that the plan outlines the use and development of the property and is designed to provide for the future growth and development of business that seek an aesthetically attractive working environment.

- 1. Is the development designed to integrate well with adjacent developments?
- 2. Is the development designed to minimize nuisance impacts on adjoining parcels?
- 3. Is the development designed to ensure safe and functional traffic access and parking within the confines of the property and out into the public right of way?
- 4. Is the development designed to minimize impacts on any sensitive environmental resources that may be located on the property?

City Manager O'Toole stated he received a letter from the Delta County Economic Development Alliance along with the Delta County Chamber of Commerce in support of the Planning Commission to approve the Bell's Brewery, Inc. Upper Hand expansion (copy attached).

Commissioner Caswell questioned Mr. Reese from Upper Hand Brewery, Inc. on what type of positions will be created. Mr. Reese stated all new positions will be hired approximately by February/March 2016, which will include: 1 (one) brewery manager, 1 (one) mechanical engineer/maintenance technician, 1 (one) tap room operator, 1 (one) dedicated employee for bottling, and 1 (one) assistant beer brewer position. Also, going into the future packaging operators, a warehouse operator, and inventory control will be additional positions to fill.

Mr. Reese stated the current capacity is 5,000 barrels, the fermentation and warehouse space limits the ability to increase production. They are hoping to increase to 15,000 barrels per year with the addition proposed. Mr. Reese is estimating 10,000 barrels for next year, with an increase of 15,000 barrels the following year. There are also an additional 6 tanks that would allow 20,000 barrels to be reached per year if needed.

Commissioner Williams questioned what the site discharge is and what the material consists of. Mr. Reese stated generally yeast, some beer, water, Phosphoric Acid, Phosphorus, and Nitric Acid are all possible discharges. Continued efforts/options are being researched into finding a proper PH balance.

Chairman Connor questioned how many fermentation tanks are currently in place. Mr. Reese explained the current set up consisting of 4 (four) 40 barrels and 5 (five) 60 barrels, with interest in adding 10 (ten) 100 barrels and an additional 6 (six) 100 barrels. The warehouse and the cold storage are issues limiting them with capacity and production.

~~Chairman Connor opened the floor to the public. No public comment was made.~~

A motion was made by Commissioner Buckbee, seconded by Commissioner Hellerman, to approve the site plan as submitted by Bell's Brewery, Inc. for their 6,000 sq. ft. expansion. Ayes were unanimous.

NEW BUSINESS

Project Updates:

- A. Zoning Board of Appeals Hearings/Decisions – None.
- B. Superior Trade Zone – City Manager O'Toole stated City Assessor Daina Norden will be the primary representative for the City of Escanaba to the Superior Trade Zone. City Manager O'Toole will serve as the alternate. The August meeting is being prepared.
- C. MSHDA/SHPO Certified Local Government Program - City Manager O'Toole stated we were recently approved. We are currently working with the DDA and Historic Commission through Ed Legault and Blaine DeGrave, trying to identify 3 – 5 signature buildings in downtown that we want to package for redevelopment.
- D. Delta County Planning Commission Update – Commissioner Connor discussed the wind towers decision. Delta County is working on the distance from the property line. They did not meet due to a lack of quorum.
- E. Redevelopment Ready Community Program – City Manager O'Toole discussed the report of findings responsibility work chart. It shows the objectives, evaluation criteria, recommended actions for certifications, and the primary responsible party for completion

of the task. Yellow colored items on the chart represent being half way complete; red represents work needed. The tax designation sheet was reviewed by the Planning Commission, DDA, and Historic Commission. The first priority is to include/do the community participation plan.

F. Year to Date Zoning/Land Use Permit(s) – City Manager O’Toole reviewed the below:

2	NEW RESIDENTIAL HOME	\$634,000
12	RESIDENTIAL REMODELS	\$181,500
3	NEW COMMERCIAL	\$7,510,000
18	COMMERCIAL REMODELS	\$2,489,420
1	CHANGE OF USE	\$0
0	HOME OCCUPATION	\$0
0	LAND USE PERMIT	\$0
4	DEMOLITION PERMIT	\$129,200
40	TOTAL	\$10,944,120

G. Community Master Planning Process – None.

GENERAL PUBLIC COMMENT

None.

COMMISSION/STAFF COMMENT AND ANNOUNCEMENTS

- Currently working with a developer on a project at 617/623 Ludington Street, along with 630 1st Avenue South. This is supposed to be presented at the August Planning Commission meeting.
- Sterling Energy was sent a revised term sheet. Fuel sourcing is being studied at this time.

ADJOURNMENT

A motion was made by Commissioner Caswell, seconded by Commissioner Hellerman, to adjourn the meeting. The meeting adjourned at 6:26 p.m. Ayes were unanimous.

Patrick Connor, Chairperson
Escanaba Planning Commission

James V. O’Toole, City Manager
City of Escanaba

Roy Webber, Secretary
Escanaba Planning Commission



July 7, 2015

Mr. Jim O'Toole
City of Escanaba Manager
410 Ludington Street
Escanaba, MI 49829

RE: Delta County Economic Development Alliance and Delta County Chamber of Commerce Letter of Support for Bell's Brewery, Inc.

Dear Jim;

The Delta County Economic Development Alliance along with the Delta County Chamber of Commerce would like to submit this letter of support to the Planning Commission for Bell's Brewery, Inc. Upper Hand planned expansion of their state of the art craft brewing and bottling facility in the Delta County Airport Industrial Park.

Bell's decision to locate the Upper Hand Brewery in Escanaba has resulted in tremendous economic opportunity and activity for the area. Not only has the brewery created important jobs, they've aided and diversified our strong manufacturing base. The estimated 5,400 square feet expansion to the currently facility along with the 2,780 square foot outdoor storage will have tremendous economic impact. With every bottle and package labeled Escanaba, Michigan this continues to be a way for people and businesses to view Escanaba and Delta County as the place to be to develop assets and resources.

We encourage the Planning Commission to approve the Upper Hand expansion. We believe the resulting efforts of this will improve the economic climate in Delta County and beyond.

On behalf of the organizations of the Commerce Center, we remain sincerely yours,

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Vicki Schwab".

Vicki Schwab
Director
Delta County Economic Development Alliance

A handwritten signature in cursive script that reads "Vickie Micheau".

Vickie Micheau
Executive Director
Delta County Chamber of Commerce